HISTORIC
ITHACA

Not until landmark buildings began disappearing from the center of Ithaca in the 1960s did the community think much about its architectural heritage. But since then, acting singly and in groups, its residents have won a series of battles to save and adapt to new uses a significant number of old structures well-known to generations of Ithacans and Cornellians.

By the Editor
Pioneers began settling the Ithaca area after an American colonial army drove Indians from the headlands of Cayuga Lake in the late 1700s. These early settlers located their homes along the base of East Hill. Waterpower from the gorges encouraged them and their successors to build mills in the same vicinity, so that nearly from the outset the village grew up around what is now the city's main business district.

In his book *The Cornell Campus*, Prof. K.C. Parsons describes the community of the 1860s:

"Ithaca was then very like hundreds of other villages in upstate New York: its broad gridiron streets lined with neat white Greek Revival houses and more recent, less stylish workmen’s homes, yards fenced to keep chickens and livestock in and dogs out. Here and there a more pretentious town house with a French mansard roof had shouldered its way into the ranks. Goldwin Smith wrote that there was scarcely a house that wore the aspect of extreme poverty, though there were a good many Irish. "There was a good deal of width in the place," he said, "all the dwellings were simple and the habits of their owners equally so."

Andrew D. White's recollections weren't quite so enthusiastic. He said later of Ithaca "that it seemed the place had 'sprouted, borne fruit and gone to seed.'"

The most notable of the early Ithaca buildings was the Clinton House, opened about 1830 as one of the finest of the "grand hotels" west of the Hudson. Ezra Cornell returned to Ithaca a wealthy man in the 1850s, investing in a variety of commercial ventures and in the 1860s gave the community a public library that bore his name. It was an indication of a generosity that would lead him shortly to endow Cornell University.

Floods and fires took their toll of downtown buildings. The Ithaca Hotel knew several incarnations before the most recent structure at State and Aurora Streets was built, after fire had destroyed its predecessor in 1871. The original Clinton House was added onto, top and rear, at the same time. A dramatic fire destroyed its top floors in 1901, and a few years later fire demolished Ithaca Academy, diagonally across the intersection of Cayuga and Seneca Streets from the Clinton. In 1912 a new Ithaca High School replaced the academy on the same site.

The architecture of Ithaca came to be a mix of many styles. The work of Cornell's first student of Architec-
Early landmarks of downtown Ithaca, the Cornell Public Library and the Ithaca Hotel, were said to have outlived their usefulness by the late 1950s. Both have been razed.

...
When the old City Hall was marked for demolition, preservationists rallied to save other old buildings. After City Hall came down, a parking garage took its place.

became more than public officials would pay. The fiscal incentives of Urban Renewal were almost all in the direction of tearing down old buildings and replacing them with new, and in short order the 1871 Ithaca Hotel joined the list of structures marked for destruction.

This was the point in community life when a group of residents, many with Cornell connections, began to feel the need for organized resistance to the trend to demolition. They banded together as Historic Ithaca and Tompkins County, Inc., now referred to in the community as simply Historic Ithaca.

Central to the early group were local business people Agda Swenson Osborn '20 and Mabel DeMotte; banker A.W. Chamberlain; Florence Hoard, whose husband was a faculty member; Elizabeth Lucey Simpson '34, a leader in community beautification efforts; and Prof. Walter Stainton '19, speech and drama, president of the DeWitt Historical Society in the county. A key figure in much of their work since has been Prof. Stephen Jacobs, history of architecture, a national authority on historical preservation and president of Historic Ithaca for a number of years.

At Historic Ithaca’s organizational meeting in 1966, a speaker from the National Trust for Historic Preservation told her audience it should consider the fated City Hall “a burnt offering.” But she urged Ithacans to consider their fine old buildings an important part of the community’s heritage, and suggested they make an inventory of important and saveable buildings. At one point she made a distinction between historical and “hysterical” preservation, and the frenzy of the next eight years was to raise a question at times as to just what balance was in fact being struck between the two approaches to preservation.

A first project of the young group was to identify the significant Ithaca buildings that were in greatest danger of demolition. Four structures were agreed upon, all within three blocks of the center of the city: The Clinton House, the former Ithaca High School, the administration building of Ithaca College (since come to be known as the Boardman House), and the century-old second courthouse of Tompkins County.

Each had been allowed to deteriorate badly and each was being considered for sale, demolition, or both: The
Clinton by its private owner, the school by the Board of Education, and Boardman and the former courthouse by Tompkins County, which was their landlord.

The leaders of Historic Ithaca soon learned how difficult it is to raise money to renovate old buildings. The cost of renovating and adapting old structures is hard for builders to estimate accurately, particularly without a clear idea of their ultimate use. Donors and potential tenants cannot be given firm cost figures, and banks will not promise loans until exact details of use, expense, and income are available.

This merry-go-round of indecision was mounted by Historic Ithaca in 1972 when owner David Saperstone let it be known to the community that he wanted to sell the formerly grand, now shabby and sagging Clinton House. Since its reconstruction after the 1901 fire, a succession of owners had put money into the building. But in recent years, relatively little had been done. When Elizabeth Rogers wrote the booklet The Enduring Clinton House in 1970 she recorded that the building had at the time but six elderly tenants.

Saperstone was asking $200,000 for the Clinton, in the absence of which he proposed to demolish and replace it with a small hotel or a gas station. Historic Ithaca's leaders were looking for buyers but could find none. They soon began negotiating for purchase themselves, with the hope of adapting the 20,000 square feet for stores, a restaurant, and office space. In the meantime, the county was poised to enter another series of tortuous deliberations over the fate of Boardman House. Saperstone was persuaded to wait until that was settled, to permit Historic Ithaca to concentrate its efforts on just one old building at a time.

Once that Boardman crisis was safely past, Historic Ithaca tackled the Clinton House. Two months of dealings ensued before Saperstone made what he termed a final offer. He asked for a $30,000 down payment and assumption of his mortgage of $55,000, and insisted on an answer in one week.

Between January 5 and 15, 1973 fundraisers collected pledges of $32,000 from individuals in the community. The preservationists swallowed hard and made their decision. A month later Historic Ithaca held title to a 140-year-old landmark well beyond its prime of life.

The diversity of talent in Historic Ithaca soon became apparent. One group went quickly to work raising funds and seeking tenants for Clinton House, and a second started the thankless task of undoing decades of neglect by refurbishing the massive building.

In the face of both efforts were two recent Cornell graduate students in fine arts, now making their livings as interior decorators, Constance Saltonstall and Victoria Romanoff. They had been living in a barn in Newfield that they were remodeling [May 1971 News], and
The long-suffering Clinton House became a highly visible symbol of community effort.

what they now accomplished in less than a year was nothing short of remarkable.

Together they organized, directed, and labored alongside a small army of volunteer and paid workers which in less than ten months stripped the finish from, repaired, and repainted or otherwise refinished nearly the entire outside of the building, as well as its basement and first floor. Clinton House was ready for its first paying occupant, the DeWitt Historical Society, which had agreed to lease the two completed floors for ten years at $20,000 annual rent, to house the county museum.

To assure the community they were serious, the new owners had gone right to work at the outset on the scabrous front of the building. A crew of young painters tackled the job, moving up the wall gradually as spring turned to summer, in the end completely covering its face with scaffolding. A Historic Ithaca newsletter reported:

“Our patient painters, under the direction of John Novarr, are repairing every crack, the ‘tin’ (all the ‘topside’ decoration is sheet metal) and stripping all the paint off with a revolutionary technique—caustic soda mixed with corn starch and water slapped on the paint to brew for a while. The resultant goo is washed off with high powered hoses.

“Sometimes resembling the Ancient Mariner in appearance (yellow slickers . . . beards), six men work enthusiastically (they like the building!) every day. The labor bill will run to $10,000 (a bargain) and materials will add another $5,000.”

Meanwhile, inside, Saltonstall and Romanoff put together crews of electricians, plumbers, finish-stripers, welders, concrete pourers, sheetrockers, and painters, who cleaned up the basement, repainted foundation walls, poured new floors, and put into shape the hotel’s ancient hydraulic lift elevator. Civil engineer Gustav Requardt ’09 of Baltimore had identified the significance of the elevator and its venerable mechanism, which is now a handsomely restored and spotlighted feature of the building.

Housewives worked alongside professionals in the grimy and sweaty heavy labor. Gretchen Sachse, an unemployed PhD in classics, and other women demolished an unnecessary wooden rear wing to the building. A writer noted that Sachse’s archaeological training “lead her to rescue artifacts of great interest and value which you or I might have added to the rubbish pile. As a result, we have a good collection of letters, nails, bottles, pegs, etc. which tell the story of the wing.”

Painter Larry Allen removed four layers of finish from the oak woodwork in the lobby and left the space a showpiece of the building. Carol Sisler, whose husband is a Cornell professor and who is herself part-time executive secretary of Historic Ithaca, spent nearly fulltime as a first floor painter. When some of the stamped tin panels in the ceiling of the old first floor dining room proved to
be damaged beyond repair, Lowell Reiland fashioned a mold from which fibre glass replacement panels could be formed.

Mrs. Sachse and her husband contributed more than time to the project. She gave birth to a son in January 1973, and within a month he was her steady companion at the work site, unofficial mascot of the renovation.

The crews were a mix of craftsmen and amateurs. Tradesmen contributed their time at much less than their going wage. One was described as "our Harvard graduate electrician." The chief of the exterior paint crew had left by fall to begin architecture study at Cornell. All contributed in various ways. "As final backing," a Historic Ithaca newsletter noted, "the work crew is purchasing New York State lottery tickets."

As 1974 began, the historical society was moving into its rented museum quarters, an interior steel fire stairway was in the finishing stages, and work crews were moving upstairs to complete upper floors for offices that could be rented.

The first year had seen the new owners spend $127,000, mostly on construction and materials, but including a partial payment on property taxes. Although taxes are not required of the enterprise at this point, they are being paid as a matter of example and principle.

Money for the first year's work had come from a variety of efforts of a finance committee under the chairmanship of a bank trust officer, Courtney Crawford, LLB '54. Marion Grunman Phillips, wife of Ithaca College president Ellis Phillips Jr., spearheaded a solicitation of foundations, which contributed $23,000 on top of $30,000 from Phillips's own foundation. A street dance, auctions, historic building tours of the county, and other fundraising efforts added another $17,700. Individual contributions provided the balance of $53,000 that went to cover the first year's expenses.
The Clinton's east face cleaned and repaired, painters restore the outside in gleaming white and a Victorian buff yellow. Inside, Historic Ithaca's executive secretary Carol Sider (right) prepares to apply a final coat to the first floor dining room, and a young workman cleans the mechanism of the building's hydraulic-lift elevator, since made a highpoint of tours of the Clinton House.

Among the items sold and auctioned were the original tables, panelling, and stained glass windows from the venerated Dutch Kitchen, which Saperstone had brought along from the Ithaca Hotel that he formerly owned, when he bought the Clinton. They are now newly installed two blocks to the south on Cayuga Street in a Ramada Inn that has been built as part of the city's Urban Renewal effort.

Historic Ithaca also had the services of numerous architects and professional consultants, and of Allan H. Treman '21, an attorney and a former trustee of Cornell University.

The Ithaca Journal acknowledged the signal accomplishment involved in saving the Clinton House when it named Connie Saltonstall and Vicky Romanoff Ithaca's "women of the year" for 1973.

There was no letup in activity as the new year started. Historic Clinton House (the original preservationist group's new venture was now incorporated) announced a $210,000 package of projects needed to complete renova-
Today the repainted and partially renovated Clinton House is a shining example of what private effort can accomplish in reclaiming ancient structures.

Most hopeless of all, at the start, appeared to be DeWitt Junior High School, the former high school. State school-building subsidies rendered replacement less expensive than renovation. (Similar fiscal incentives had already cost the city the Ithaca Hotel in 1968.)

A state Urban Development Agency had been created and was at work in Ithaca. Its good offices were used to conduct a study of community charitable organizations which might be viable tenants for the 110,000 square feet of space in the 55-year-old brick school building. But paupers that they were, the various youth and social agencies provided no hope of paying the freight for renovation and for the continuing expenses of the DeWitt building.

The Board of Education put DeWitt on the market, and attracted in the end only one bid, $20,000, for a property that had been carried unquestioningly on tax assessment rolls at $2 million.

The sole bidder had been William Downing, an Ithaca architect, and his wife Elaine Treman Downing '50. They
planned to convert the building for apartments, shops, and offices.

A cry went up from a small but vocal segment of business people and citizens. "Robbery!" they claimed, and set in motion a series of delaying actions and court tests that were to put the future of the building under a cloud for more than a year. The school board was immediately taken to court by Saperstone, who owned properties across the street from the school. He lost his case, but his cause was picked up by another Ithacan, since become a perpetual litigant of the Ithaca school district, who went into court again to challenge the sale to the Downings. Vandalism struck, requiring a superintendent to live in the building earlier than planned; and the court cases hung over the new owners' efforts to borrow money for renovations.

A year later the last court case was finally settled, and the first apartments and stores were ready to be occupied. That was September 1972. Today, with all 48 apartments and all 20 stores and offices rented, the venture is acclaimed a success by both owners and community. Many of the tenants are older and retired Ithacans, including school teachers who once taught in the building. The stores are an exotic mix vaguely reminiscent of the Larimer Square renovation in downtown Denver—a natural food restaurant and men's and women's clothing stores, a natural food bakery, the offices of the American Agriculturist magazine, and a computer firm.

Into the project went at least a half million dollars worth of plumbing, partitions, new wiring, zoned heating, and hundreds of new window casements. Downing reports the project will never make him rich, but is running well in the black in its second year, and paying $30,000 in taxes where once the community had at best to contemplate the property becoming a vacant lot or another downtown parking lot.

With the south border of DeWitt Park saved, attention moved to the remaining three sides of the half-block area that has been a key element of downtown Ithaca for more than a century. The west side was secured by private rehabilitation of two houses. One is the 1821 Halsey House, built in the Federal style and restored by two decorators and antique dealers, Brian Nevin '50 and C.W. Southwick. The other westside house is the American renaissance Williams House, built in 1906 and restored by Lyman Fisher '28, MD '31 for his offices. (The county go
government also dedicated a new county public library on the park's west side in the late 1960s, successor to the demolished Cornell Public Library.)

The north side of the park comprises the Presbyterian church, in no danger of demolition, and the 1854 Court House, oldest Gothic Revival courthouse in the state. The building was displaced as the seat of Tompkins County government in 1932 with the construction of a new courts and offices building. Since then the building has housed the DeWitt Historical Society museum and various offices. Time eroded the exterior of the structure, and many in government thought it should be razed. In the mid-1960s, the county employed a preservation architect to assess its value and the cost of restoration. After much back-and-forth, the county decided to remodel the building's grand Inns of Court original courtroom into a meeting room for the county legislature, and otherwise to refurbish space for further use as offices. The federal government, which had placed the building on the National Register of Historic Places in 1971, granted the county $156,000 toward an estimated $300,000-plus renovation.

Opposite page, the north and east sides of DeWitt Park as seen from an apartment in the converted high school building on the park's south side. From left are the Presbyterian church, the Old Court House, the Baptist church, a parking lot for the new Court House (at rear), and the embattled Boardman House. Opposite page (below), a key feature of the Old Court House is its former courtroom which served until last year as a museum. Architect William H. Miller '72 put in this false ceiling in an earlier renovation. At left, the old high school as it appears today, converted to house stores, offices, and apartments like the one above, which in earlier years was the school library.
expense. A decision to start work is expected soon.

The most bitter battle remained to be fought over the east side of DeWitt Park, the fate of which is still in doubt. The 1880 Baptist church at the northeast corner, designed by William H. Miller, is secure for the time being, but the remainder of the east side had been made up of former Ithaca College buildings, sold to the county after the college relocated to South Hill in the 1960s. Among the buildings is the one now known as the Boardman House, after Judge Douglass Boardman, a trustee and first dean of law at Cornell, for whom Boardman Hall on the Cornell campus was named. Boardman House was kept in use after Ithaca College moved out by the enthusiasm of Howard Dilligham, retired president of the college, and his artist wife, the former Dorothy King Hoyt ’31, who saw to it that the building served temporarily as the college’s museum of art.

At first, the county planned to remodel the entire college building complex into office space, but estimates came in high. Plans for a new building on the same site also proved too costly, and of unpopular design as well. County lawmakers next decided to demolish all of the complex except for one cement block building and the 1867 Italianate style Boardman House, while looking for new building options.

The decision to grant Boardman House a temporary reprieve was influenced in significant part by a “Save Boardman House” campaign organized by members of Historic Ithaca. Bumper stickers, benefit events, and a variety of meetings and public statements went to make up the campaign, which culminated in the delivery of petitions containing signatures of several thousand persons asking the county to retain the building and find some new use for it.

Efforts to find private buyers for Boardman proved fruitless. A number of county officials felt public pressure to save the building, whose exterior had deteriorated badly, was unrealistic. Ithaca College and the county evacuated the building, and vandals immediately smashed windows and some of its interior. Demolition of surrounding buildings exposed sashless window openings and ugly connecting abutments at the building’s rear, leaving for the time a helpless hulk at the southeast corner of DeWitt Park. The county continued to entertain offers for purchase.

Several years after the county first began to consider demolishing Boardman House, the City of Ithaca created a Landmarks Preservation Commission and declared the entire DeWitt Park area a historical zone. The city and county went into court this winter in a dispute over whe-
While Boardman House still stands as a relic of the unfinished fight to save DeWitt Park, other projects in preservation continue elsewhere in Ithaca.

Boardman House is boarded against further vandalism.
Demolition of adjacent buildings exposed its rear. A restaurant and boat rental docks (above) replace old Inlet sheds.

...the county has to file for a demolition permit. Private parties have by now all but given up hope of finding a buyer.

Ironically, the success of other preservation efforts in Ithaca has depleted the resources available to groups and individuals that might undertake renovation of Boardman, a project that has been calculated to cost $100,000 or more. Once the former high school at the south end of the park was secure under the Downings' ownership some of the pressure to retain Boardman House as an architectural "frame" for the park was diminished. The building that was an original rallying point for local preservationists may shortly be lost. It has become, in a sense, a symbol, possibly due to become a second "burnt offering" in the public and private efforts to retain the essence of an earlier Ithaca.

Formally organized preservationists have not been the only savers of old buildings at work in the community during the past decade. On their own, and more quietly, both Cornell University and other private interests have been adapting old buildings.

Relatively few academic buildings have been removed on the Cornell campus since the institution first started constructing in the 1860s. All of the original faculty cottages have disappeared, and along with them the original laboratory on the main quadrangle, Morse Hall, the Old Armory, and finally Boardman Hall. Boardman was in design an extension of the University Library (now Uris Library), both buildings having been designed by William Miller. Like its namesake downtown, it was an early
focal point of Cornell preservationists, but it came down in 1959 to make way for Olin Library.

Prof. John Reps, MRP '47, city and regional planning, led a battle to save another Miller design, Barnes Hall, when plans for a new Campus Store threatened it in the 1960s. Barnes still stands today, hemmed in by the entrance to the new underground store on one side and Olin Hall on the other.

A second preservation battle on campus was won when President James A. Perkins acceded to alumni and faculty pressure to save the former Andrew D. White house [October 1973 News] which is now a home for humanities studies and for the Society for the Humanities.

Elsewhere in Ithaca, the list of adapted buildings is considerable: In Collegetown, a former fire station is now Old No. 9's restaurant, and the Sheldon Court student residences are now offices and stores. Downtown, the old Crescent Theater is now office space, a former GLF office building has become the city jail and courts building, the former Eagles Lodge is a store and office building, Central School is a community center, a former fraternal lodge and funeral home is now a day center for the retarded, and a former bank and post office in the center of the city houses a store and has for years been home to the Cornell Daily Sun.

At left, Barnes Hall on the Cornell campus has been saved but crowded by new neighbors. Top, waiting room of the Lehigh station is now a restaurant. Bottom, the William Sage mansion on East Hill survives in truncated form after a top-floor fire.

On East Hill the Henry Sage home has long since become Sage Hospital for the university, and the old community hospital on Quarry Street, after serving as a college student dormitory is now being remodeled into a domiciliary care home for the elderly.

Further from the center of the city, the Lehigh Valley Railroad passenger terminal is now The Station restaurant, old boathouses on the original Cayuga Inlet have become Olde Port Harbour Ltd., restaurant and boat rentals, and Sunny Gables, the former home of the late H.E. Babcock, chairman of Cornell’s Board of Trustees in the 1940s, is now Turback’s restaurant.

How much these many and diverse efforts have drawn for experience and example upon one another is impossible to measure. It is safe to say, though, that many forces, political and cultural as well as economic, have contributed.
The site of the Ithaca Hotel, soon to be filled by a shopping center and another parking garage, has been a reminder since 1968 of the dangers of hasty demolition.

What lessons are other communities drawing from Ithaca's experience? Professor Stephen Jacobs, the architectural historian at Cornell, sees the many Ithaca efforts as combining the six main forces that can be brought to bear to achieve historic preservation. In a monograph titled "A Current View of Area Preservation," he explains that both private and public effort is available from each of three levels: national, regional, and local.

Federal money is being used to repair Ithaca's Old Court House, state and local government funds are helping Clinton House (the local, through county funding of the major tenant). Some private national funds have flowed to work on the Clinton House, private local funds made possible the saving of the former school building.

Federal "landmark" and "historic places" listing has recognized a number of the key old buildings in Ithaca, which helped in obtaining federal and state funds for their adaptive restoration. (In the second administration of President Nixon, however, a number of ambitious renewal programs launched by the federal government in the mid-1960s have been stripped of funds and will not be available for the future.)

Tompkins County's city and county governments are still feeling their way toward a concerted policy of landmark preservation. The first major effort is to be a countywide inventory of buildings and places worthy of recognition and protection. The city's landmarks commission and its use of historical zoning are only now being tested in the courts to determine whether their procedures are enforceable.

The ripple effect of private preservationist efforts in the city was felt in the neighboring township of Danby this March when the town government sought to abandon its leaking, rundown 1826 Town Hall in favor of a rectangular cement block replacement. Town voters defeated the proposal resoundingly, primarily on the issues of history, economy, and aesthetics. Vacant Urban Renewal lots in the business section of Ithaca itself still give downtown Ithaca something of the effect of a wasteland. But in the long list of private and semi-public buildings adapted to modern uses, the community in and around Ithaca has evidenced a growing awareness of the worth of recycling the best parts of its past.